



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-8804
Website www.aznd.gov
TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janice K. Brewer – Governor

Catherine Walker, NMD. - Chair • Daniel Rubin, ND– Vice Chair • Mr. Evan Zang - Secretary/Treasurer
Mr. Kip Micuda JD - Public Member • Renee Waldman, NMD – Physician Member
Ms. Linda Barron, Public Member • Dr. Bruce Sadilek, NMD – Physician Member
Craig Runbeck, ND – Executive Director

MINUTES
BOARD MEETING

Thursday January 14, 2010 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
The meeting was called to order at 1:00 PM. Roll Call: Dr. Walker, Present; Dr. Sadilek, Present; Mr. Micuda, Present; Dr. Waldman, Present; Dr. Sadilek, Present. Mr. Zang Present via phone.
6 Present, 2 Absent.
Ms. Barron joined the meeting at 1: 05 PM
Dr. Rubin joined the meeting at 1:15 PM.
B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Present were Dr. Craig Runbeck, Executive Director; Ms. Elizabeth Campbell, Assistant Attorney General; Ms Gail Anthony, Deputy Director.

2. Call to the Public

No requests to address the Board were received.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Consent Agenda

- A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of November 12, 2009
The Board approved the board meeting minutes of November 12, 2009.

A. ED. Report

No action required by the Board.

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application

Table with 2 columns: Name (Susan Williams) and empty cell.

The Board approved the issuance of license(s) by examination.

C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement

Table with 2 columns: Name (Melissa Gastellum, Clement Lee)

The Board approved the issuance of license(s) by endorsement..

**D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Medical License**

|                       |                             |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------|
| Angela Wojtowicz      | Danya Epstein               |
| Kathleen Dang         | Nicole Barreda              |
| Carlie Bell           | John Hinze                  |
| Barbara Marsh-Jones   | Katerina Novakova           |
| Erin Fitzgerald       | Elaine Burns                |
| Rachel Rhodes         | Robin Terranella            |
| Larry Abel            | Eric Bower                  |
| Sharon Stills         | Natalie Ham                 |
| Cheryl Kasdorf        | Robin Borsa                 |
| Stephanie Pina        | Jason mneil                 |
| Paul Anderson         | Tabish Malik                |
| Laryn Callaway        | Judy Hinojosa-Sinks         |
| Randy Spicer          | Linda Oksman                |
| Matthew Cavaiola      | Erika McKeen                |
| Nael Dagstani         | Christina Kovalik           |
| Lauren Pilgren        | Carol Jamison               |
| Sheldon Deal          | Anna K. Cascio              |
| Melenie Dunn          | Lisa Amerine                |
| Maria Bell            | Roxie Strand                |
| Raushanah Najeeullah  | Edward Shabezd              |
| Donese Worden         | Peggy Maxwell               |
| Nathan Vitaro         | Jessica Tran                |
| Jeffrey Lee           | Jessica Anderson-McLaughlin |
| Christian Armanti     | Yvonne Skinner              |
| Mark James            | Emily Keranen               |
| Nick Buratovich       | MaryJo Watkins              |
| Andrea Spira-O'Connor | Tam Spat                    |
| Mark Strom            | Barbara Koudelka            |
| Shauna Birdsall       | Timothy Birdsall            |
| Brandy Pierce         | Jeffrey Sager               |
| June Stevens          | Christy Cline               |
| M. Ann Murray         | Chad Goetz                  |
| Linda Lambert         | Maureen Wilson Hwang        |
| Laurinda Kwan         | Robert Myers                |
| James Hutton          | Cristina Romero-Bosch       |
| Alicia Miller         | Carol McCalment             |
| Jo Turner             | Tiffany Binder              |
| Meghana Thanki        | Kathryn Sage                |
| Cathy Forbes          | Krystal Tellier             |
| Michael Uzick         | Barbara Berens Oxley        |
| Kareen O'Brien        | Wendy Wells                 |
| Valeria Birch         | Dana Myatt                  |
| Mona Morstein         | Valerita Breiten            |
| Clinton McJunkin      | Leah Anderson               |
| Ann Lovick            | Summer Swanick              |
| Patricia Herman       | Wallace, Norman             |
| Maureen Schwehr       | Carrie Rittling             |
| Susan Calimeri        | Joanne Feaster              |
| Adam Kerievsky        | Louise Gutowski             |
| Thomas Frank          | Laurie Moody                |
| Eric Udell            | Dana Keaton                 |

|                         |                     |
|-------------------------|---------------------|
| Kenneth Lashutka        | Patricia Beck       |
| Mary Ellen O'Brien      | Laura Kennedy       |
| Chriselda Beltran       | Elizabeth Grady     |
| Meghna Thacker          | Dawn Eller          |
| LoRal Linton            | Albert Chavez       |
| Ardeschir Mehrabani     | Stephanie Stark     |
| Anita Larrow            | Mario Howell        |
| Philip Grasso           | Michelle Thatcher   |
| Matthew Baral           | Monique Lai         |
| David Cramer            | Alexander Coracides |
| Dino Sainati            | Karsten Alexandria  |
| Bonnie Wick             | Joel Morgan         |
| Jillian Finker          | Julie Keiffer       |
| Mary Marcantel          | Damien Brandeis     |
| Melinda Whitsell        | Lutea Saldivar      |
| Danite Haller           | Sima Aidun          |
| Eric Hampton            | Linda Ferguson      |
| Kiera Smialek           | Adrienne Borg       |
| Jennifer Gentry         | Dianna Heath        |
| Kristen Fujii           | John Eldridge       |
| Lezlie Link             | Rebecca Carpenter   |
| Vance Inouye            | Anne Marie Fine     |
| Yezid Callejas          | Robb Bird           |
| Jose Ortiz              | Jeffery Knytych     |
| Lori Barnes             | Laura Lambert       |
| John Imundo             | Margot Longenecker  |
| Robert Upchurch         | Tursha Hamilton     |
| F. Debbie Jacques       | Jeni Keilty         |
| Julie Stears            | Karlee Heffner      |
| Shana Spector Deneen    | Barbara Dapcic      |
| Kristen Berkner         | Wayne Black         |
| Hope Farner             | Michael Chung       |
| Jennifer Nevels         | Dora Muttart        |
| Autumn Holder           | Christina Compton   |
| Janice Skelton          | Marcos de Escobar   |
| Stephanie Eastman       | John Hawrylak       |
| Nicole Antonucci Taylor | James Reagan        |
| Rebecca Cooke           | Dawn Bantel         |
| Andrea Weiner           | Herbert Schuck      |
| Teresa Vesco            | Donald Baker        |
| Alice Alibrio           | Allison Pritchard   |
| Margie Simmons-Stubber  | Jody Krukowski      |
| Miriam Peachy           | Delores D'Aprile    |
| Kimberly Engard         | Ross Kerievsky      |
| Amira Ahdut             | Lance Morris        |
| Robert Morrissey        | Yuko Takeda         |
| Ravi Chandiramani       | Barbara Ezrre       |
| Karen Vaughan           | Julie Gorman        |
| Jennifer Dye            | Suneil Jain         |
| Paul Stallone           | Philip Wazny        |
| Diane Hawk              | Scott Jamison       |
| S. Ross Dunbar          | Anna Nordin         |
| Marie Santora           | Amanda Frick        |

|                      |                      |
|----------------------|----------------------|
| Kathleen McCaleb     | Nicole King          |
| James Witman         | Chad Schroer         |
| Ann Seipt            | Barbara Brooks       |
| Steve Nenninger      | Francesca Quinn      |
| Sibongile Mnguni     | Theresa Ramsey       |
| Sara Bedell Cook     | Kristen O'Rourke     |
| Peggy McGarey        | Nancy Mullis         |
| Shannon York         | Kimberly Williford   |
| Paula Triplett-Foss  | Aralan Cage          |
| Charles Wilkinson    | Ryan Krch            |
| Laura Sickels        | Mark Dietzgen        |
| Sonal Patel          | Frank Sweet          |
| Mariam Malek         | Lindsey Pearson      |
| Apryl Krause         | Joseph Brown         |
| Allison McDaniel     | Kristy Anderson      |
| Jill Hoffman         | Eric Cerre           |
| Laree Hooker         | Jaime Ewald          |
| Matthew Mitchell     | Elizabeth Rice       |
| Leslie Marcum        | Jonathan Powell      |
| E. Friederike Doak   | Andrew Kaufmann      |
| Susan Whiting        | David Daily          |
| James Pendleton      | David Arneson        |
| Laura Boe            | Betty Yurgel         |
| Susanne Macsay       | Diana Buehler        |
| Karen D;Huyvetter    | Tracy Magerus        |
| Ken Blackman         | Theo Christodoulakis |
| Garrett Smith        | Kyle Neeley          |
| Katherine Raymer     | DeAnna Woeller       |
| Nita Champion        | Nate Champion        |
| Miriam Gilbert       | Dejarra Sims         |
| Jessica Bramstedt    | Stacy Riseborough    |
| Ralph Potter         | Timothy Visser       |
| Tracy Wooten         | Yu-Ree Hyun          |
| Rhonda Steinke       | Denette King         |
| Timothy Peace        | Lawrence Caprio      |
| Daniela Hutyrova     | Annette D'Armata     |
| Shelly S. Weisman    | Sandra Colvard       |
| Marie Niechwiadowicz | Taylor Arbour        |
| Aimee Bachelier      | Michele Caragiulo    |
| Sara Rodgers         | Michelle Michael     |
| Mia Darling          | David Hagen          |
| Margarita Guzman     | Anesia Groves        |
| Sarv Varta Khalsa    | Timothy Schwaiger    |
| Mario Calaburri      | Ty Tallman           |
| Margaret Husami      | Thomas Jamison       |
| Steven Ehrlich       | Grant McKernan       |
| Beth Poindexter      | Michelle Mossell     |
| Cheryl Johnson       | Cori Kennedy         |
| Andria Orlovski      | Carlos Santo         |
| Deborah Vacik        | Miriam Weber         |
| Tara Peyman          | Kimberly Landino     |
| LanceHering          | Sabine Garrett       |
| Gilbert Alvarado     | Brendan McCarthy     |

|                        |                       |
|------------------------|-----------------------|
| MaryK Geyer            | Patricia Gaines       |
| Tiffany Mitchell       | Susan Godman          |
| Wendy Wang             | Denise Grobe          |
| Tue Truong             | Brandon Chastant      |
| Richard Hodge          | Katrina Steinberger   |
| Cheryl Sly             | Patricia Pringel      |
| Victoria Green         | Laura Mittman         |
| Emmanouil Karampahtsis | Wayne Spence          |
| Heather Wdowin         | Bryan McConnell       |
| Alan Rader             | Alexander de Soler    |
| Leslie Axelrod         | Nancy Robins          |
| Marianna Fisher        | Heidi Koerner         |
| Amy O'Hara             | Kelly Crinnion        |
| Charmonique Tims       | Walter Crinnion       |
| Kenneth Proefrock      | William Nelson        |
| Judy Hiell             | Jean-Lu LeProvost     |
| Robert Gear            | Shanna Tobar          |
| William Troutt         | Valerie Olmsted       |
| Lisa Richardson        | Rebekkah Sax          |
| Henry Ealy             | Christina Tondora     |
| Angela Bilyeu          | Jennifer Kaymeyer     |
| Jennifer Mundt         | Yashpal Jayne         |
| Murray Dowell          | Irina Riabikina       |
| Susan Hawkins          | Dorothy Karcheski     |
| Karen Van Der Veer     | Karen Willfahrt       |
| Jessica Curcio         | Mark Rudderham        |
| Shawn Joyner           | Susan Rudderham       |
| Valerie Nix            | Keith Chambers        |
| Todd Smith             | Susan Williams        |
| Ramon Esquerdo         | Lahari Wikramanayake  |
| Glenn Ozalan           | Julie George          |
| Inge Barth             | Susan Wojcik          |
| Kathryn Cameron        | Anne Palzer           |
| Judith Hones           | Becky Tanner          |
| Sara Hazel             | Veronique Pangia Kerr |
| Teri Davis             | Noemi Quintanar       |
| Robert Ellsworth       | Vanessa Edwards       |
| Chrystie Eggerling     | James Sheehan         |
| James Tuggle           | Benjamin Zorensky     |
| Alison Redwine         | Lisa Maturo           |
| Amy-Jane Lilie         | Ave' Sims             |
| David Tallman          | Susan Stratton        |
| Jason Porter           | Bianca Munoz          |
| Erica Middlemiss       | Edward Geller         |
| Lawrence Helms, Jr.    | Christie Yerby        |
| Tara Swartz            | Michelle Turcotte     |
| Cho Long Elizabeth Kim | John Hartman          |
| Thomas Lee             | Jami Kupperman        |
| Lisa Hilli             | Robert Streisfeld     |
| Heather Yarbrough      | Candice Jackson       |
| Fred Arnold            | Teresa McBride        |
| Michael Berke          | Erica Campbell        |
| Jeannine Maschek       | Stephanie Gajus       |

|                    |                            |
|--------------------|----------------------------|
| Orville Weyrich    | Kenna Barber               |
| Kimberly Volk      | Bruce Scher                |
| Heather Moroso     | Linda Kim                  |
| Cheryl Larson      | Sandra Olic                |
| Sara LaRoche       | Emily Davenport            |
| Sherdeen Graham    | Frances March              |
| JoAnn Yanez        | David Craig                |
| Andrea Purcell     | Filiberto Flores           |
| Jennifer Ball      | Alan Van-Putten – Laguerre |
| Jeanette Gallagher | Brandie Gowy               |
| Eli Ber            | Jonathan Psenka            |
| Allen Anderson     | Lewis Underwood            |
| Kevon Arthurs      | Gladys Ceballos-Logan      |
| Yolanda Rodriquez  | Michael DiPalma            |
| Christine Sorensen | John Dye                   |
| Randall Robinson   | Tara hickman               |
| Rebecca Ford       | Gilberto Leon              |
| Tiffany Weeks      | Deborah Ardolf             |
| Melissa Dengler    | Patricia Johnson           |
| Natalie Wiggins    | Markin Babij               |
| Jacqueline Carboni |                            |

The Board approved the issuance of the renewed medical license(s).

**E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) / Request(s) to Retire Medical License**

|                 |                 |
|-----------------|-----------------|
| Dawn Eller      | Alexis Brereton |
| Konrad Kail     | Eric Wood       |
| Agostino Diroma | Natasha Ryan    |

The Board approved the retirement of medical license(s).

**F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)**

|                               |                                  |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Deborah Ardolf                | Erin Fitzgerald                  |
| Raushanah Najeeullah          | Julie George                     |
| Keith Chambers                | Lauren Pihlgren                  |
| Ahdut, Amira                  | Jason McNeil                     |
| Margot Longenecker            | Tiffany Mitchell                 |
| John Eldridge (reinstatement) | Donald Baker (reinstatement)     |
| Miriam Peachy                 | Robert Morrissey (reinstatement) |
| Shannon York (reinstatement)  | Emily Keranen                    |
| Marie Niechwiadowicz          | Margarita Guzman                 |
| Taylor Arbour                 | Cori Kennedy                     |
| Jean-Luc LeProvost            | Judith Jones                     |

The Board approved the issuance of certificate(s) to dispense.

**G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program**

|              |                 |
|--------------|-----------------|
| Judith Ziol  | Chris Deszynsky |
| Dane Buzbaum | Corey Skinbisz  |
| Sean Scheses | Nanao Takaki    |

|                  |                    |
|------------------|--------------------|
| Analiah Patrice  | Eric Lopez         |
| Krysine Nguyen   | Monica Vaghela     |
| Taylor Hill      | Teresita Barrantes |
| Sally Burgess    | Hadassah Hilewitz  |
| Alanna Harrison  | La Deana Jeane     |
| Laura Munro      | Shabnam Saran      |
| Melissa Highes   | Lynnette Balentine |
| Andrea Hillstad  | Heather Wojslaw    |
| Angela Darragh   | Carmel Ferreiran   |
| Joshua Chrystal  | Luann Cullen       |
| Sana Eang        | Maria Helioti      |
| Carolyn Thomason | Scott Just         |
| Carolyn Stone    | John Oertle        |
| Daniel Warren    | Esti Bakty         |
| Isabel Sharkar   | Kira Morrill       |
| Ephraim Crocker  |                    |

The Board approved the issuance of the certificate(s) for clinical training.

**H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program**

|                |                  |
|----------------|------------------|
| Jenn Botham    | Adrienne Stewart |
| Susan Lundgren | Rebecca Whelchel |

The Board approved the renewal of certificate(s) for clinical training.

Ms. Barron joined the meeting prior to the vote.

**Consent Agenda vote: Mr. Micuda moved to accept the consent agenda, items (3) A, C, D, E, F, G, H, and I. Second by Dr. Sadilek. Motion carried 6 Present 1 Absent.**

Dr. Rubin joined the meeting at this time.

**4. Regulatory Matters**

**A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.**

**(1) Dr. Kirk Slagel, Case No. 10-005 Formal Hearing.**

Dr. Slagel was present. Ms. Campbell, A.A.G. represented the State. Mr. Munns, A.A.G. was present, representing the Board. Ms. Gail Anthony testified as a witness for the State. Dr. Slagel requested and was afforded the opportunity to make copies of evidence he wished to present to the Board, but had not prepared prior to the Board meeting.

The Board moved on to item 4 (A) 4 on the agenda, during this time.

After completion of review and vote of Item 4 A (4), the Board resumed consideration of item 4 A (1).

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr Rubin made a motion to adopt the findings of fact; as presented, with the exception of amending the language in item 3, by removing the words “failed to be” and inserting the words “was not”. Seconded by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 7 Ayes.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to adopt the Conclusion of Law, as presented. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 7 Ayes.

Mr. Zang and Mr. Micuda left the meeting prior to the following vote.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to suspend Dr. Slagel’s

medical license whereby the terms of probation under the existing consent agreement will be placed on hold. Suspension of the license will remain until he has completed a re-evaluation with a Board approved evaluator and the report has been submitted to the Board for review and approval. If the Board approves the reinstatement of his medical license at some point in the future, the terms of the existing probation will resume for the remaining time left as stated under the terms of probation. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek, Abstained; Ms. Barron, Aye; Dr. Waldman, Aye; Dr. Rubin, Aye; Dr. Walker, Aye. 4 Ayes 1 Abstention., 2 Absent.

**(2) Dr. Carole Eastman, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agreement for Surrender of Medical license. This matter was taken out of order as item 1.**

Dr. Eastman was present and addressed the Board. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to accept the consent agreement for licensure surrender. Second by Mr. Micuda. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek, Aye; Ms. Barron, Aye; Dr. Waldman, Abstain; Mr. Zang, Aye; Mr. Micuda, Aye. Dr. Walker, Aye. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Abstention, 1 Absent.

**(3) Dr. Gioacchino Franco, Case No. 06-032, 08-001 and 09-057. Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agreement.**

Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to accept the consent agreement. Second by Dr. Sadilek. Roll Call: Dr. Waldman, Aye; Ms. Barron, Aye; Dr. Sadilek., Aye; Dr. Walker, Aye. 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(4) Dr. Eric Udell, Case No. 10-003. Investigative Interview.**

**This item was taken into consideration by the Board out of order.**

Dr. Udell was present with Counsel Ms. Carole M. Romano, made statements to the Board and answered questions. The complainant was present and made statements to the Board. After review and consideration, Dr. Rubin made a motion to dismiss the complaint. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 7 Ayes.

**(5) Dr. Eric Hampton. Petition of Termination of Probation. This item was taken out of order after the conclusion of item 4 (A) 1**

Dr. Hampton was present and made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the termination of probation. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 Ayes. 2 Absent.

**B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Persons Applying for Renewal of Medical License. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.**

**(1) Dr. Gioacchino Franco, Open Investigations** After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

**(2) Dr. Bruce Sadilek.** Dr. Sadilek recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(3) Dr. Heather Paulson, Works with Dr. Rubin**

**(4) Dr. Melissa Coats, Works with Dr. Rubin**

**(5) Dr. Debora Smolinski, Work with Dr. Rubin**

**(6) Dr. Dan Rubin**

**(7) Dr. Leila Turner, Works with Dr. Rubin**

Items 3-7 were taken into consideration together. Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the licensure renewal(s). Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(8) Dr. Catherine Walker**

**(9) Dr. Samuel Walker**

**(10) Dr. Tamara Torres, Works with Dr. Walker**

Items 8-10 were taken into consideration together.

Dr. Walker recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the licensure renewal(s). Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(11) Dr. Sam Walters Open Investigations**

**(12) Dr. Jennifer Burns, Open Investigations**

Items 11 and 12 were taken into consideration by the Board together. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal(s). Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

**(13) Dr. Renee Waldman**

Dr. Waldman recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(14) Dr. Carole Eastman**

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to allow for the withdrawal of the medical license renewal. Second by Dr. Sadilek. Motion carried 5 Ayes. 2 Absent.

- 5. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board on Election of Board Officers. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.** After discussion and consideration, the Board agreed to keep the Board Officers for 2010 the same as they were for 2009.

**ADJOURNMENT: THE BOARD WAS ADJOURNED AT 5:00 PM**

---

ARIZONA NATUROPATHIC PHYSICIANS MEDICAL BOARD

---

DATE