



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board
 “Protecting the Public’s Health”

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-8804
 Website www.aznd.gov
 TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janice K. Brewer – Governor

Catherine Walker, NMD. - Chair • Daniel Rubin, ND– Vice Chair • Mr. Evan Zang - Secretary/Treasurer
 Mr. Kip Micuda JD - Public Member • Renee Waldman, NMD – Physician Member
 Ms. Linda Barron, Public Member • Dr. Bruce Sadilek, NMD – Physician Member
 Craig Runbeck, ND – Executive Director

MINUTES
BOARD MEETING

Thursday December 9, 2010 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
 The meeting was called to order at 1:00 PM
 Dr. Sadilek; Present, Ms. Barron; Present, Mr. Micuda; Present, Dr. Rubin; Present, Dr. Walker;
 Present. 5 Present, 2 Absent.
- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
 Present were Ms. Elizabeth Campbell, Assistant Attorney General, Ms. Gail Anthony, Deputy
 Director. Dr. Craig Runbeck, Executive Director joined the meeting at 1: 15 PM

2. Call to the Public

No public wished to address the Board.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Consent Agenda

Dr. Rubin moved to accept the consent agenda items. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

- A. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of September 9th. 2010.**
 The Board voted to accept the minutes as written.
- B. **ED. Report**
 Information on this item was presented as the last item on the agenda. Dr. Runbeck advised the Board that he would be seeking to be reappointed to full time employment at the January meeting. He has been working part-time in conformance with ASRS rules for the last year. He also discussed political issues potentially impacting the Board.

C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application

Nazanin Vassighi	Christine Strong, Reinstatement
Christina Youngren, Reinstatement	Ryan Partovi
Seth Black	Timothy Peace
Eric Wood, Reinstatement	Maleigha Watts
Lahnor Ridley	April Syko

The Board voted to approve the application(s) for medical license by examination.

D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Temporary License(s) to Practice Medicine

DeeAnn Grimes Saber	Nazanin Vassighi
Christine Strong	Christina Youngren
Seth Black	Maleigha Watts
Aaron Stowell	

The Board voted to approve the application(s) for issuance of temporary medical license.

E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement

DeeAnn Grimes Saber	Aaron Stowell
Daphne Cornman	Stephanie Seitz
Ken Mitchell, Pending Receipt of verification from HI	Jessica Hayman, Pending Receipt of verification from VT.
Leslie Cisar, Pending Receipt of verification from VT.	

The Board voted to approve the application(s) for medical license by endorsement.

F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Medical License

Roger Adair	Eli Ber
Melissa Dawahare	Farra Swan
Reiner Kremer	Peggy Maxwell
Linda Jarvis	Dana Myatt
Timothy Birdsall	Heath McCormick
Karen Vaughan	Julie Gorman
Katka Novakova	Michele Nickels
James Sensenig	Kyle Neeley
Andrew Dickens	Philip Wazny
Jorge Badillo Cochran	Mark James
Sandy Lutrin	Babak Nafe
Jamie Oskin	Sonja De Graaff
Jeffrey Sager	Shana Turrell
Jean-Luc Le Provost II	Kami Winchell
Victoria Zupa	Richard Petke
Linda Lambert	Simon Sung
Kimberly Volk	Jeffrey Winton
Kevin Pare	Deborah Rogalla
Lorraine Sumegi	Susan Calimeri
Michael Chung	Marianne Marchese
Shauna Birdsall	Dana Keaton
Garrett Wdowin	Brian Popiel
Gioacchino Franco	Alan Christianson
Barbara Koudelka	Robb Bird
Matthew Cavaiola	Jennifer Mundt
Sonja Pettersen	Amy Whittington

Christine Girard	Mary Poore
John Robinson	Adam Kerievsky
Barbara Oxley	John Oxley
Kimberly Williford	Frank Sweet
Olya Stouk	Shaida Sina
Jessica Tran	Ryan Ferchoff
Margot Longenecker	Chriselda Beltran
Mary DiFilippo	Elaine Burns
Joseph Brown	Nael Dagstani
Colleen Huber	Sarah Preston Hesler
Shahrzad Orona	Laurinda Kwan
Lila Flagler	Samuel Flagler
Michael Whitney	Steve Nenner
Linda Oksman	Carol Spooner
Rachel Rhodes	Carol Revak
David Tallman	Autumn Holder
Kyle Cronin	Laura Weeshoff
Mary Ann Stalker	Monica Jeffers
Thomas Kruzal	Nick Buratovich
Stephen Lee	Scott Jamison
Judith Curtis	Kimberly Landino
Randy Spicer	Lori Barnes
Kiera Lane	Robert Milisen
Summer Swanick	Camille Teale
Carol Jamison	Bryan McConnell
Michael Cronin	Tam Spat
Crystal Song	Shana Deneen
David Arneson	Yu-Ree Hyun
Louise Gutowski	Nicole Barreda
Leah Anderson	Tracy Margerus
Rebecca Whelchel	Peggy McGarey
Danite Haller	Eric Udell
Robert Upchurch	Jennifer Burns
DeAnna Woeller	Lauri Moody
Jeffrey Lee	Katherine Neubauer
Richard Petke	Barbara Marsh-Jones
Dorie Muttart	Emily Keranen
Nirvana Tehranian	Brian Archambault
Paula Triplett-Foss	Meagan Harris Crossley
Kenneth Kashutka	Kiera Smialek
Sara Rodgers	Stephen Messer
Stephanie Pina	Alicia Miller
Anita Larrow	Clark Hansen
Jesika DiCampli	Gina Tizio
Adrienne Wilson	James Reagan
Cheryl Deroin	Mary Jo Turner
Damien Brandeis	Elizabeth Rice
Ann Lovick	Eric Cerre
Stephanie Eastman	Mario Howell
John Eldridge	Karen D'Huyvetter
Bradley Smith	Susan Williamson

Joanne Feaster	Valeria Breiten
Jennifer Gentry	Rebecca Cooke
Alexander Coracides	Michelle Hoppe
Krystal Tellier	Andrea Purcell
Barbara Ezrre	Justin Taylor
Nicole Taylor	Karen Freeze
Sibongile Mnguni	Brandy Pierce

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for renewal of medical license.

G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)

DeeAnn Grimes Saber	Rhonda Steinke
Michelle Retz	Amy Elizabeth Terlisner
Katrina Stage	Thomas Jemison
Richard Petke	Aaron Stowell
Gemie Kohler	Barrie Zeller
Rebecca Whelchel	

The Board voted to approve the application(s) for initial issuance of certificate(s) to dispense.

H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense

Sara Hazel	Miriam Weber, Reinstatement
Seth Black	

The Board voted to approve the application(s) for renewal of certificate(s) to dispense.

I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Senit Debesai	Darren Hazen
Kathleen May	Carolyn Thompson
Kira Morrill	Alanna Harrison

The Board voted to approve the application(s) for renewal of certificate to engage in a clinical training program.

J. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Preceptorship Training Program.

Shannon Treen	
---------------	--

The Board voted to approve the application for certificate to engage in a preceptorship training program.

4. Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Dr. Sam Walters, Case No. 09-052 and Case No. 10-001. Discussion, Consideration and possible action on proposed consent agreement.

Mr. David Smith and Mr. Steven Myers, counsel for Dr. Walters was present. After discussion And consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron moved to accept the consent agreement. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Barron; Aye, Mr. Micuda; Aye, Dr. Rubin; Aye, Dr. Walker; Aye. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

(2) Dr. Grant McKernan, Case No. 10-004 – Investigative Interview. Discussion, consideration and possible action on proposed consent agreement.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to accept the consent agreement. Seconded by Ms. Barron. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Barron; Aye, Mr. Micuda; Aye, Dr. Rubin; Aye, Dr. Walker; Aye. Motion carried 5 Ayes. 2 Absent.

(3) Dr. Henry Ealy, Discussion, Consideration and possible action on proposed consent agreement.

Dr. Ealy was present. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to accept the consent agreement for non-disciplinary continuing education. Seconded by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 ayes, 2 Absent.

(4) Dr. Chrystie Eggerling, Formal Interview – Discussion and possible action on proposed consent agreement.

Dr. Eggerling was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to adopt the proposed consent agreement as written, with the exception of removing finding of fact 3 and conclusion of law 4. Seconded by Ms. Barron. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Barron; Aye, Mr. Micuda; Aye, Dr. Rubin; Aye, Dr. Walker; Aye. 5 Ayes, 2 Absent. Motion carried.

(5) Dr. Yolanda Rodriguez – Investigative Interview. Case No. 10-020

Dr. Rodriguez was present with Counsel, Mr. Ed Gaines. Dr. Rodriguez and Mr. Gaines made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to move the matter to Formal Interview giving staff the ability to negotiate a consent agreement to include 12 hours of CME in addition to the 30 hours required each year and issue a Letter of Reprimand. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried, 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

(6) Dr. Alexander de Soler – Investigative Interview. Case No. 10-029

Dr. de Soler was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to move the matter to Formal Interview, giving staff the ability to negotiate a consent agreement to include the terms as stated in the investigative report. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

(7) Dr. Kathy Kamin – Investigative Interview. Case No. 10-018

Complainant JS was present, made statements and answered questions. Dr. Kamin was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to dismiss the complaint. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

(8) Dr. Gioacchino Franco – Investigative Interview. Case No. 10-024

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Sadilek moved to move the matter to Formal Interview, approve the consent agreement for non-disciplinary CE, that is before the Board and authorize the Executive Director to accept the agreement should the Respondent sign it. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

(9) Dr. Kathleen Muratore – Investigative Interview. Case No. 10-035

After discussion and consideration by the Board. Dr. Rubin moved to move the matter to Formal Hearing and combine it with the open case involving Dr. Muratore that is currently pending before the Office of Administrative Hearings. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 5 ayes, 2 Absent.

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Persons Licensed by this Board. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

- (1) Dr. Alexis Osborne McNeil, Renewal of Medical License – Works with Dr. Walker.**
- (2) Dr. Maria Cavalle, Renewal of Medical License – Works with Dr. Walker.**
- (3) Dr. Catherine Walker, Renewal of Medical License**
- (4) Dr. Samuel Walker, Renewal of Medical License**
- (5) Dr. Steven Bescak, Renewal of Medical License – Works with Dr. Walker.**

Items 1 – 5 were taken into consideration together. Dr. Walker recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved to approve the application(s) for renewal of medical license. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 recused, 2 Absent.

(6) Dr. Leila Fosdick Turner, Renewal of Medical License – Works with Dr. Rubin

Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to approve the application for renewal medical license. Seconded by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

(7) Dr. Bruce Sadilek, Renewal of Medical License

Dr. Sadilek recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved to approve the application for renewal of medical license. Seconded by Dr. Walker. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

(8) Dr. Robert Ellsworth, License Renewal - Open Complaint.

(9) Dr. Grant McKernan, License Renewal – Open Complaint.

Items 8-9 were taken into consideration together. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved to approve the application(s) for renewal of medical license, and that the license of Dr. Ellsworth is approved for renewal without prejudice to any ongoing investigation and without waiving jurisdiction in any matter pending before the Board. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

5. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application for Medical License Reinstatement. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(A) James Daily

Dr. Rubin recused himself. James Daily was present, made statements and answered questions. Ms. Barron moved to go into Executive Session for legal advise at 2:30 PM. Seconded by Mr. Micuda.

Regular Session resumed at 2:45 PM After discussion and consideration by the Board Mr. Micuda moved to deny licensure of James Daily based on the Felony conviction in 2008 for unlawful distribution of Hydrocodone, for prescribing out of scope medication via the internet, for the failure to provide information to the State of Montana Naturopathic Licensing Board, which resulted in revocation of licensure in the State of Montana and for practicing medicine without a license in the State of Colorado. These being reasons for denial based on A.R.S 32-1522 A (5) Seconded by Dr. Walker. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Barron; Aye, Mr. Micuda; Aye, Dr. Walker; Aye. 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent. Motion carried.

6. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application for Medical License. the Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(A) Luke Holiday a/k/a Todd Lukasik

Luke Holdiay was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved approve the application for licensure. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. 4 Ayes, 1 Nay, 2 Absent. Motion Carried.

7. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Request for Early Probation Termination. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(A) Dr. Jennifer Burns

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved to accept the request for early probation termination. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

8. Executive Session to discuss Executive Director Personnel Matters.

The Executive Session did not occur.

ADJOURNMENT AT 3:50 PM

THE ARIZONA NATUROPATHIC PHYSICIANS MEDICAL BOARD

DATE